

NHESS-2023-85

Manuscript Title: Unveiling Transboundary Challenges in The Ciliwung River Flood Management

The authors wish to thank the editors and reviewers for their time in effort in reviewing our manuscript. We hope the changes listed have made the manuscript suitable for publication and we look forward to your response.

No	Comment	Response
	Editor	
1.	<p>The manuscript predominantly reads as a case study. Unfortunately, as it stands, such a format does not align with the publication criteria of NHESS.</p>	<p>We have restructure the paper, introduction cover:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The issues of transboundary river flood management, the impact of the extension of urban area to become urban agglomeration which worsen the challenges.• Key research problem is being addressed and the terminology associated with it• The introduction is then highlight the research problem and aims.• The benefit of the study for novel contribution in the context of global research.
2	<p>To move towards acceptance, your manuscript must establish a stronger connection with the broader body of literature and the works of other researchers in this field.</p> <p>It is imperative to identify and articulate the global research gaps your study addresses, not just those pertaining to your specific study area. You should specify your novel contribution in the context of global research, not just based on your case study.</p>	<p>We have added more in depth literature review.</p> <p>We have widened the angle of research scope, not only identifying the transboundary flood challenges/drivers but also prioritizing the drivers to be discussed for contributing to transboundary governance.</p>

No	Comment	Response
3		There is additional figure to support the description and analysis of the case study for lesson learned.
4	Your manuscript must clearly demonstrate its unique contribution and relevance in a global context. Consider how your findings would be perceived and valued by an international audience. What insights could they derive from your methodologies and their applications? It is crucial to explicitly state the novel aspects of your work and how these contribute to the broader scientific community.	We have revised the paper as suggested. The revised paper has also been reviewed by the co-author Richard Haigh, followed by some major changing.