

Harkunti P. Rahayu Response to Animesh Gain, Executive Editor, NHESS Final Comment per 26 November 2023.

Animesh Gain, Executive Editor, NHESS Comment	Harkunti P. Rahayu Response
I appreciate your submission of the revised manuscript titled “Unveiling Transboundary Challenges in The Ciliwung River Flood Management” (NHESS-2023-85) to our journal.	Thank you very much
Upon review, I acknowledge the improvements made over the previous version. However, there remain significant areas that require further revision. Although currently classified as a 'minor revision', please be advised that without addressing these key issues, the manuscript may not be accepted for publication. In this light, I urge you to consider submitting a more substantially revised version.	The suggestion has been accommodated for through review by myself from page 1 to the last page, by having more argument and more literature so the position of the paper in area of flood risk management as well as the transboundary flood risk management.
Additionally, for a clearer comparison, please include a document highlighting the changes made from the previous submission to the new version.	Done.
The manuscript predominantly reads as a case study. Unfortunately, as it stands, such a format does not align with the publication criteria of NHESS. To move towards acceptance, your manuscript must establish a stronger connection with the broader body of literature and the works of other researchers in this field. It is imperative to identify and articulate the global research gaps your study addresses, not just those pertaining to your specific study area.	The revision has included the better connection with broader body of literature and other works of other researchers. To identify and articulate the global research gaps your study addresses has been in the revision.
Your manuscript must clearly demonstrate its unique contribution and relevance in a global context. Consider how your findings would be perceived and valued by an international audience. What insights could they derive from your methodologies and their applications? It is crucial to explicitly state the novel aspects of your work and how these contribute to the broader scientific community.	The revision has considered to demonstrate clear unique contributions and relevance to a global context of flood risk drivers. The findings have been elaborated and discussed more in depth. The novel aspects of the study has been elaborated clearly.
I am eager to review the next version of your manuscript, upon which I will base my decision.	Thank you, looking forward to good results.