Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2020-135-RC1, 2020 © Author(s) 2020. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



NHESSD

Interactive comment

Interactive comment on "Forecasting dam height and stability of dams formed by rock slope failures in Norway" by Thierry Oppikofer et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 22 May 2020

Dear authors,

please, see some comments included in the annotated reviewed manuscript.

The two main ones are the following:

.. the title should clarify that you basically use semi-empirical methods, you discuss the use of numerical methods .. but without cross-validating, the paper does not really provide new information compared with what was known before - besides the specific information on Norwegian rockslide dams.

... as indicated above: the term 'forecasting' promises more than what you really develop as new technique and produce as new results. I clearly expected some joint numerical-empirical approach ... after the title 'Forecasting ...'. while some numerical

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



results are presented to produce/reproduce the form of a landslide dam - I do not see where a real stability analysis is performed?

So, I recommend to adapt the title to the content of the paper, and to present a real dam stability analysis - if this was the objective of your study.

yours rev 1

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

https://www.nat-hazards-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/nhess-2020-135/nhess-2020-135-RC1-supplement.pdf

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2020-135, 2020.

NHESSD

Interactive comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

