Interactive comment on “Forecasting dam height and stability of dams formed by rock slope failures in Norway” by Thierry Oppikofer et al.

Anonymous Referee #1
Received and published: 22 May 2020

Dear authors,

please, see some comments included in the annotated reviewed manuscript.

The two main ones are the following:

.. the title should clarify that you basically use semi-empirical methods, you discuss the use of numerical methods .. but without cross-validating, the paper does not really provide new information compared with what was known before - besides the specific information on Norwegian rockslide dams.

... as indicated above: the term ‘forecasting’ promises more than what you really develop as new technique and produce as new results. I clearly expected some joint numerical-empirical approach .. after the title ‘Forecasting ...’. while some numerical results are presented to produce/reproduce the form of a landslide dam - I do not see where a real stability analysis is performed?

So, I recommend to adapt the title to the content of the paper, and to present a real dam stability analysis - if this was the objective of your study.

yours rev 1

Please also note the supplement to this comment: https://www.nat-hazards-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/nhess-2020-135/nhess-2020-135-RC1-supplement.pdf