Natural Hazards
and Earth System
Sciences

Discussions

EGU Open Access

Interactive comment on "Landslides distribution at tributaries with different evolution stages in Jiangjia Gully, southwestern China" *by* Xia Fei Tian et al.

Odin Marc (Referee)

odin.marc@unistra.fr

General summary : The author study a debris flow prone catchment. They performed some landslide mapping and some topographic classification of sub-catchments and attempt to link the two to propose that hypsometric analysis may be useful for landslide studies. The topic may be of interest for NHESS readers. Hypsometric analysis in relations to landslide are relatively rare, so it may be novel. However, this imply that the utility of such new index also needs to be thoroughly demonstrated, that is not the case in the current state of the paper. Specifically I have large concerns about the meaning of the landslide mapping, the poor quality of most of the caption and figures and the

number of unsupported statement.

The large amount of work to be done may change drastically the (data supported) result and conclusions, and I am therefore uncertain whether a major revisions could be enough for the paper to be upgraded to scientific standard or whether, it should simply be rejected and with an invitation to resubmit.

Please find my detailed comments and suggestion in the attached file.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
https://www.nat-hazards-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/nhess-2019-90/nhess-2019-90-RC2-supplement.pdf

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2019-90, 2019.