

Interactive comment on “A GIS-based three-dimensional landslide generated waves height calculation method” by Guo Yu et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 2 November 2019

Dear authors, Dear editor,

I have reviewed the aforementioned manuscript (nhess-2019-230). The study presents a GIS-based approach to calculate waves from 3D-approximated landslides. The study is very interesting, partly well written and the research objective is relevant. However, results and discussion are not or very rudimentary presented. I suggest the authors to perform a **major revision** of their manuscript. Please find general and specific comments below.

General comments - The study fits in the scope of the journal. - Although the title comprises the topic of the study, it reads staccato-like caused by the many nouns listed one after the other. I believe rephrasing the title a bit so that it appears to be more fluent to the reader would be beneficial for recognising the study. - The manuscript is well

structured but massively lacks of detailed presentation of results and a comprehensive discussion of the findings.

Specific comments - Figure 2 looks a bit messy and should be improved. - In my perception, Section 2.1 should be moved to an appendix. - There is a Section 2.1 and 2.3 but no 2.2. - Line 164: Just mention the reference and the year, not the full name. - Line 186: See previous comment. - Line 191-208: This should be moved in an appendix. - Line 209: A section should not start with a figure. - Line 214-216: How is this performed in ArcGIS? - Section 4.1 should be extended and renamed in my opinion. - Based on the results (?) presented and the entire manuscript, the reader is not able to comprehend the conclusion made by the authors.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2019-230>, 2019.

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)

