

Interactive comment on “Multicriterion assessment framework of flood events simulated with the vertically mixed runoff model in semiarid catchments in the middle Yellow River” by Dayang Li et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 17 March 2019

Dear authors,

I think you performed a lot work whose results deserve to be published. The topic addressed in your manuscript is interesting and I think that not only statistical hydrologists will benefit from its publication, either from the decision-makers point of view as well as from the perspective of semiarid catchments. However, I noticed several instances in your manuscript that force me not to accept it for publication in its current state.

First, I would like to emphasize that all my detailed comments are included in the

C1

attached PDF file. Please, kindly see this attached file at the same scale, so you could find the places which my comments point to properly.

The paper is well structured, but a large number of style corrections is required.

Here are my general comments only:

The discussion of the results is not clear and, in my opinion, could be extended due to the huge effort made in the study. The authors are encouraged to extend the discussion of the results obtained by the explanation of possible causes of differences among hydrological models.

The initial condition is essential for this type of simulations. Thus, the authors should explain better this section.

Regarding the references shown in the manuscript, some are not listed in the reference list, and also there are some errors in the reference list. Please, check the standards of the journal and correct them.

I strongly recommend to undertake some check of the language (e.g. by some professional service offered directly by Springer on you websites). Without a doubt, there are some places in the text that are hardly understandable due to the language.

I believe my comments will help you improve your MS, which will lead to is final publication.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://www.nat-hazards-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/nhess-2018-402/nhess-2018-402-RC2-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2018-402>, 2019.

C2