

Interactive comment on “Landsliding near Enguri dam (Caucasus, Georgia) and possible seismotectonic effects” by Alessandro Tibaldi et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 29 September 2018

Dear editor,

this manuscript presents an analysis of an interesting landslide site near a large water reservoir. The site is well described - but the core part (as presented in this manuscript) is relatively weak. The geophysical survey is not adapted to the scale of the site - and not this kind of mass movement investigation. GPR is commonly used in paleoseismic studies - where only one fault scarp is analysed. In this context here, it does not provide any useful information and the results are unclear (and even contradictory for one site). The numerical modelling is most likely not a 'numerical modelling' but just a pseudo-static analysis of stability of a slope section performed with a software. So, these two

C1

parts are quite weak (look like results of a contractual study, not of a scientific analysis) - while the description of the site, and of the deformation monitoring is fine. Also, I do not understand why the HVSR results that should be quite interesting for defining the subsurface structure are not presented (... instead of the relatively useless GPR data).

Then, the discussion is not a discussion but a new part of the paper with additional information - most of which should have been included in the main part of the manuscript.

Therefore, my conclusion is that parts of this paper should be dropped or presented elsewhere, parts from the Discussion included in the main part (... establishing a link between local structures and general tectonics).

More detailed comments are included in the attached annotated manuscript.

Sincerely yours Reviewer H

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://www.nat-hazards-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/nhess-2018-186/nhess-2018-186-RC1-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-2018-186>, 2018.

C2