

***Interactive comment on “Tree-ring response to the
1995 M_w 7.2 Kobe earthquake, southwest Japan”
by Sujian Lin and Aiming Lin***

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 7 April 2018

I have never seen a scientific dendrogeomorphology paper based on one sample! The transition from wide to narrower rings could be related to factors other than the earthquake, such as drought or a late growing season, soil stress (shrink/swell clays, for example), or other negative factors impacting growth. The authors give no information on site conditions of the tree sampled, nor of the climatic conditions of the years of wide growth and years of narrow growth after the earthquake, so there is no way to discern if the narrow rings might be a climatic response rather than a geomorphic response to tilting/stress. I would never allow a graduate student to submit a paper based on an $N = 1$, and frankly was astonished to see a paper submitted to this journal based on one tree-ring sample. The paper should be rejected.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/nhess-C1>

2017-381, 2017.