

Interactive comment on “Analysis of applicability of flood vulnerability index in Pre-Saharan region, a pilot study to assess flood in Southern Morocco” by A. Karmaoui et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 13 June 2016

The paper "Analysis of applicability of flood vulnerability index in pre-saharan region.." presents the application of an established method of computing flood vulnerability indexes for a particular catchment. Though the method is not new its applicability in pre-saharan region is interesting to be looked at. What I did miss however is that the paper presents a very simple step by step application of the method with no new additions, nor testing its applicability in the region. It is a simple gathering of data and crunching it in a formula. I do not know what is a difference between the results presented in this paper and a technical report evaluating vulnerability to floods in the region.

Apart from the fact that the English narration of the paper is difficult to read, the

C1

manuscript needs a lot of work before it can be brought to a publishable level. I would suggest the authors to re-write the paper with a research component in it, to have a new added value to the tested methodology. The authors may follow their own title suggestion by making a wider analysis of the method, referring to its applicability, not to its application to a particular case study. I would expect that authors will look what are the conditions in which such an index is applicable in pre-saharan region, where preparedness for floods is not so spread. What should be the indicators that would be more important than others, or maybe what are the indicators that can be left out.

Discussion is very short and quite vague, not focusing on the findings from the application of the method. Also conclusion part is very vague, not focusing enough on the region itself, as promised in the title of the article.

I have minor comments on the text that I could add after the manuscript revision of the concept has been done.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., doi:10.5194/nhess-2016-96, 2016.

C2