



Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Brief Communication: Climate, topographical and meteorological investigation of the 16–17 June 2013 Kedarnath (India) disaster causes” by R. Singh et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 13 May 2015

This paper presents a study about a devastating flash flood event that occurred in India (June 2013).

In my opinion this study needs major revisions to be clearly separated from previous works already published about this disastrous event (e.g. Dobhal et al., 2013; Joseph et al., 2013).

Also i suggest major revisions in the following topics:

1 - the title of the paper - I suggest to change: "Brief communication: climatic, meteorological and topographical causes of the 16-17 June 2013 Kedarnath (India) natural

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



disaster event.

2 - the Disaster event (floods) date referred in the text (17-18 June) is not the same of the rainfall event (16-17 June). Why does this happen? This topic should be clear in the text.

3 - Introduction

1st paragraph - "...and is normally associated with landslides and related dangers". You should specify which dangers are these.

2nd paragraph - ".....rest of hilly area is covered by trees and bare land". Which species of trees? This should be clear to the reader.

3rd paragraph - How long it took to the lake fill?

Figure 1 is quite similar to Fig 5. of Dobhal et al., 2013. In my opinion if you do not present a new figure, this one should be eliminated. Also you can replace this by a location map of the study area with the affected places and rainfall stations location.

4 - Data source

1st paragraph - This text should be included in the observations and discussion section.

5 - Observations and discussion

1st paragraph - "there was considerable rainfall during 15-17 June, with a maximum on 16 June." This sentence does not mean anything because considerable rainfall is a qualitative attribute. You should quantify the rainfall and its meaning in your climatic zone.

Relation between cloud temperature and altitude should be better explained in the text.

The sentence ..." Kedarnath town is situated on.....river cuttings" should be moved to the introduction section because it describes the area.

"The population is over flooded beyond the capacity of the valley" - How many inhabi-

tants lived here? How many died? These details should be included in the paper.

6 - Conclusion

The innovative contribution of this work should be presented in the conclusion.

Also I strongly recommend an English revision of the text because there are many grammatical erros and doubtful sentences.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 3, 941, 2015.

NHESD

3, C690–C692, 2015

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper