



Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Modelling of the hydrological connectivity changes in the Minjiang Upstream after the Wenchuan earthquake using satellite remote sensing and DEM data” by H. Z. Zhang et al.

P. Tarolli (Editor)

paolo.tarolli@unipd.it

Received and published: 23 April 2015

First of all I would like to thank the two referees and Lorenzo Marchi for providing a very useful discussion that definitely should help the authors to highlight the main critical issues of their work. The referee #1 recommended a major review, while the referee #2 strongly recommended a rejection. The short comment provided by Lorenzo Marchi, in addition to few interesting and technical comments on the equations 3 and 4, underlines the lack of novelty/originality respect to the previous papers that published

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



similar connectivity indexes.

In general, i would have expected the authors to provide a detailed public reply to each comments raised by the reviewers. One of the addressed values of NHESS (and of Copernicus Journals), is the Open Discussion. Everyone can interact and see in detail if the authors have understood the critical issues raised by the referees, and vice-versa if the reviewers provided a suitable review. Having said that, at my eyes the present public discussion is really poor. The authors provided a quick reply without detailed explanations.

What I'm suggesting now is to improve the public discussion, especially in the replies to the reviewer #2 and to the short comment. I will make my final decision (if reconsider the manuscript after a second stage of review, or stop the paper at this stage) only after this.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 3, 1113, 2015.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

