Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 3, C422–C423, 2015 www.nat-hazards-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/3/C422/2015/

© Author(s) 2015. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



NHESSD

3, C422-C423, 2015

Interactive Comment

Interactive comment on "The asymmetric impact of natural disasters on China's bilateral trade" by Y. Meng et al.

M. Modica (Referee)

marco.modica@ircres.cnr.it

Received and published: 10 April 2015

Dear authors,

I have really enjoyed reading your paper since it is definitely well written and furthermore the description of the impact of disasters on trade is remarkable. However I'd like to see more effort in the econometric analysis since, currently, I have some remarks that could affect results of the paper and, lastly, reduce dramaticaly the novelty of the paper.

Here some comments that should be considered in a furthere revision of the paper:

i) It seems authors use simple cross-section analysis. Panel analysis has to be pre-

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



ferred in this framework. ii) estimation by means of ordinary least squares in a log-log setting bias the results. iii) The change in sign in models (9) and (10) for importer's disaster variable might denote the presence of multicollinearity. iv) the estimated for China's disaster are not reported even though they are essential in the analysis. v) disasters are considered only in numbers but not in magnitude.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 3, 2003, 2015.

NHESSD

3, C422-C423, 2015

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

