

Interactive comment on “Chronology and impact of the 2011 Puyehue-Cordón Caulle eruption, Chile” by M. Elissondo et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 13 January 2016

This manuscript analyses the impacts of tephra fallout on population, infrastructures and environment following the 2011 Cordón Caulle eruption in Chile. On its present form, the paper is composed of two clearly differentiated parts that do not merge coherently. Part 1 (~80% of the text) is essentially a compilation of information and data on different aspects from a variety of different sources. In my opinion, this first part is too long and merges information that could be relevant and of broad interest to potential readers with a lot of anecdotic and secondary aspects of much less scientific interest. The compilation effort and work is substantial, but the information is not filtered and ranked properly and, in many cases, lacks of referencing. It is unclear which parts are original contributions (if any) and looks more a report than a scientific paper. Part 2 (essentially section 13 and parts of 14) is more quantitative, although short and

C2963

not fully convincing methodologically (particularly last paragraph of sec, 13). I would suggest the authors to consider two different publications; one build upon Part 1 (removing superfluous information) and another expanding Part 2. Journals and target audiences should probably be different for these two.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 3, 5383, 2015.

C2964