

Interactive comment on “Landslide inventory development in a data sparse region: spatial and temporal characteristics of landslides in Papua New Guinea” by J. C. Robbins and M. G. Petterson

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 11 September 2015

I have revised the paper “Landslide inventory development in a data sparse region: spatial and temporal characteristics of landslides in Papua New Guinea” submitted by J. C. Robbins and M. G. Petterson. The paper is well written, easy to read and could be very interesting for the journal. However has some major problems that should be clarified by the authors.

1) It's not clear the completeness of the inventory. How many source of information have been searched? The inventory contains for the whole Papua New Guinea (452,860 sq km) 86 landslide-triggering events. 86 is a very small number compared to the extent of PNG and the quantity of severe rainfall events. It's not clear if the

C1630

database is complete and representative to justify the analysis.

2) In the inventory authors consider together entry related to one major landslide and entry related to more than 1000 failures. The two events are completely different and should be analyzed in a different way.

3) It is not clear the spatial distribution of events with different magnitude and impacts. When you have more than 10 failures how large is the area affected by the event? One slope, one basin, one region? This makes a very big difference in both the temporal and spatial analyses.

4) When you have more than one failure, how many points do you add to the spatial (GIS) layer (if available. It's not clear!)? This makes the evaluation of the spatial distribution (figure 9a) very diverse. See the previous comment.

Comments on chapters 3.2 and 3.3 are highly connected to the above observations. Several comments are in the text.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.nat-hazards-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/3/C1630/2015/nhessd-3-C1630-2015-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 3, 4871, 2015.

C1631