



Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Movement of the Donglingxin landslide, China, induced by reservoir inundation and rainfall” by J. Yu et al.

P. Tarolli (Editor)

paolo.tarolli@unipd.it

Received and published: 30 June 2015

Dear Authors,

I have now examined the entire discussion on your paper entitled “Movement of the Donglingxin landslide, China, induced by reservoir inundation and rainfall”. Two reviewers raised major critical issues, in addition to a third external short comment. I agree with all the comments raised, especially those raised by the reviewer #2. You provided a series of replies, however at my eyes these are not enough.

The details about the accuracy of the measurements are few, the discussion about the results is really poor, and a suitable quantitative analysis is missed. Chapter 6 and 7 are really short. They need to be significantly enlarged. In addition, it is really difficult

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



to understand the figure 12, and the methodology behind. What about this simulation? Which model has been considered? Are there any quantitative analysis or statistics about this simulation? What about the calibration? What about the validation?

Concluding: the paper needs to be deeply revised. Now it is not ready for publication. If you are willing to make the necessary revisions, I will be pleased to reconsider your submission, with the help of the same reviewers who examined the present work. In submitting your revised version, please provide a detailed list of the changes made to the text, and a detailed list of your responses to each reviewer's comment. I recommend also to check the English grammar.

Please note that this editorial decision does not guarantee that your paper will be accepted for final publication in NHESS. A decision will be made when the revised version will be available, and will be evaluated.

Best regards

Paolo Tarolli

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 3, 2537, 2015.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

