

Interactive comment on “Assessment of the effectiveness of participatory developed adaptation strategies for HCMC” by R. Lasage et al.

R. Lasage et al.

ralph.lasage@vu.nl

Received and published: 24 April 2014

General

We would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive suggestions and comments. In general the three reviewers appreciate the methods and results of the paper. However, reviewers two and three indicate that the participatory approach needs further explanation. In addition, several other issues were raised, which need further clarification, such as who pays for adaptation and to describe what other sectors are potentially affected by the floods and measures.

C490

Following suggestions by the reviewers, we have thoroughly revised the paper, and we believe the paper has significantly improved. Below follows a detailed response to the reviewer. In the supplement we have included a pdf of the response, in which the individual suggestions by the reviewers is in ‘italics’, followed by our response. In the manuscript we have included the changes in ‘sticky notes’.

Response to reviewer #3

1) The manuscript presents an interesting approach of an important topic. It illustrates a really broad survey on adaptation strategies; the number of interviews conducted in the case study area is impressive.

We appreciate the kind remarks of the reviewer.

2) However, I do share the opinion of referee #2 regarding several aspects of the methodology. Since the title of the paper is explicitly underlining the participatory approach the text is given astonishing little information on how the interviews are conducted, how the stakeholder are analyzed and identified, how the workshops were done et cetera, in brief on the participatory methods which have been used and why the study was designed like that. The title is also not clear because there is no information on what kind of adaptation strategies the paper s dealing with.

In re-reading the paper, we agree with the reviewer that the title implies that we do more on the participatory approach than actually is presented in the paper. To overcome this issue, we have removed the term ‘participatory’ from the title, added “flood” in the title, to make explicit what type of risk and adaptation we are dealing with. We have changed the title into:

‘Assessment of the effectiveness of flood adaptation strategies for HCMC’.

In addition, even though the focus is not on the participatory approaches, we agree with the reviewer these methods needs more explanation. We, therefore, have elaborated the description of the participatory approach, which it now includes details on

C491

approach, techniques, and number and types of respondents. Sections 2.3.1 and 2.4 are revised accordingly (see also response to Reviewer 2)

3) The date of the land use map seems a bit old (from 2005)(see chapter 2.3, page 391, l. 17), but since the Master plan of 2025 is used as the basis for the study it is probably the best available data to be used.

Indeed the land use map is a bit old, but it was the newest that was made available to us by the Government.

4) The authors state that there was no measuring of learning outcome of the participatory process. However, it would be interesting if other kinds of evaluations have been conducted.

Another evaluation would be if the topic of climate change adaptation and flooding continues to be on the agenda in HCMC. We have added a line on learning effects. See page 23, line 2. This line now reads:

“The topic of climate change has gained importance in HCMC. At the end of the VCAPS project the bureau on climate change has been established in HCMC. People from different departments jointly work in this bureau to further develop and implement adaptation measures. Several of these people were involved in the VCAPS project, amongst which the vice managing director of the bureau. This indicates that the topic of climate change has been adopted by the policy makers and civil servants in HCMC.”

References

ADB, Asian Development Bank: Ho Chi Minh City – Adaptation to Climate Change: Summary Report, Asian Development Bank, Mandaluyong City, ISBN 978-92-9092-108-0, 2010. Brouwer, R., van Ek, R.: Integrated ecological, economic and societal impact assessment of alternative flood protection measures in the Netherlands. *Ecological Economics* 50, 1-2: 1-21, 2004.

Bubeck, P., Botzen, W.J.W., Aerts, J.C.J.H. : A Review of Risk Perceptions and Other
C492

Factors that Influence Flood Mitigation Behavior. *Risk Analysis*, 32: 9, 1481-1495, 2012.

Duc, N.H., Minh, H.N.: Vietnam: The Effect of Grassroots Democratic Regulations on Commune Government Performance and Its Practical Implications. EADN Working Paper No. 35. 2008. Institute of Political Science, Ho Chi Minh National Political Administrative Academy, 2008.

Duong, M.N.: Grassroots Democracy in Vietnamese Communes. Research Paper for the Centre for democratic Institutions, Research School of Social Sciences, the Australian National University, 2004.

Hallegatte, S., Przulski, V.: The Economics of Natural Disasters : Concepts and Methods. World Bank. © World Bank. <https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/3991> License: Creative Commons Attribution CC BY 3.0., 2010.

Hostovsky, C., McLaren, V.: The Role of Public Consultation in Vietnamese Waste and Other EIAs. First International Conference on Integrated Solid Waste Management in Southeast Asia, July 5-6, 2005. Siem Reap, Cambodia, 2005.

Jongman, S.N, Bočkarjova, M., Kok, M., Bernardini, P.: Integrated hydrodynamic and economic modelling of flood damage in the Netherlands. *Ecological economics*, 66: 77-90, 2008.

Kerkvliet, B., Tria, J.: Authorities and the Peoples: An Analysis of State-Society Relations in Vietnam” in: Luong, Hy V. (ed.). *Postwar Vietnam: Dynamics of a Transforming Society*. New York, 2003.

Pelling, M.: The political ecology of Flood hazard in urban Guyana. *Geoforum* 30, 249-261, 1999.

Tu, T.T., Nitivattananon, V.: Adaptation to flood risks in Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam.

International Journal of Climate Change Strategies and Management, 3: 1, 61-73, 2011. WATSAN: Water and sanitation sector report Vietnam 2011. 63pp. 2012.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.nat-hazards-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/2/C490/2014/nhessd-2-C490-2014-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 2, 385, 2014.

C494