

Interactive  
Comment

# ***Interactive comment on “Geomorphological surveys and software simulations for rock fall hazard assessment: a case study in the Italian Alps” by S. Devoto et al.***

**O. Katz (Referee)**

odedk@gsi.gov.il

Received and published: 6 June 2015

The manuscript (Geomorphological surveys and software simulations for rock fall hazard assessment: a case study in the Italian Alps; by Devoto et al) describes a case study of rock fall hazard in Italians Alps. A subject, which is relevant to the scope of NHESS. However at the current state of the manuscript, it is unpublishable and thus I suggest to reject it. Below are the major comments supporting my decision and in addition I attached an annotated pdf file including a few dozen specific comments.

1. The scientific analysis is lacking: The authors show an analysis which is a possible

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



analysis of the hazard, but it is not clear why this one was chosen over possible others. E.g. (1) only two trajectories are simulated, but what about possible others: not exist or not probable?;(2) only one set of coefficient used in the simulation is presented, and again what about others or what about sensitivity analysis. More examples in the annotated text.

2. The manuscript lacks any scientific-writing structure. It is a mix of paragraphs belong to Introduction, Methods (no such paragraph included) and Results all together. Very hard to follow. Many paragraphs are redundant, including a text book knowledge only.
3. The manuscript describes and analyzes a local case study with no novel finding or new methods that can be generalized to an important take home message.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.nat-hazards-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/2/C3799/2015/nhessd-2-C3799-2015-supplement.pdf>

---

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 2, 7329, 2014.

**NHESSD**

2, C3799–C3800, 2015

---

Interactive  
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

