Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 2, C3666–C3667, 2015
www.nat-hazards-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/2/C3666/2015/


Natural Hazards and Earth System Sciences
Discussions

# *Interactive comment on* "Modeling inundation of seasonally flooded wetlands at McCarran Ranch on Truckee River, USA" *by* X. Chen et al.

**P. Tarolli (Editor)**

paolo.tarolli@unipd.it

Received and published: 23 April 2015

First of all I would like to thank the two referees, especially the referee #2, for providing a very useful discussion that definitely should help the authors to highlight the main critical issues of their work. The first referee recommended a rejection, while the second, underlining the fact that the paper is potentially interesting, raised a series major points that need to be clarified. I fully agree with his/her feedback. I strongly recommend at this stage of discussion, to provide a very detailed public reply to the referee #2.

From my side I recommend to check the following points, in addition to those highlighted by the reviewers:

- the introduction needs to be significantly improved in order to enlarge the perspective



of the entire work.

- the critical issues related to the DEM grid cell size are relevant; the authors should provide in the text few more sentences and explanations on the limitations in using a 30m DEM. The authors replied to the reviewer #1 that it is available a lidar bathymetric survey, right? Please be more specific. I would like to see in the text a sub-chapter on that.

- Where are the inundation area maps? The authors, at my eyes, did not provide a suitable answer to the reviewer #1. Please clarify and eventually add these in the revised version of the paper.

- The quality of the figures needs to be significantly improved in term of dpi. Please add the scale bar in the fig. 2.

If you are willing to make the necessary revisions, I will be pleased to reconsider your submission, with the help of the same reviewers who examined the present work. Please note that this does not guarantee that your paper will be accepted for final publication in NHESS. A decision will be made when the revised version will be available, and will be evaluated.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 2, 3711, 2014.