

Interactive comment on “Pre-earthquake magnetic pulses” by J. Scoville et al.

F. Masci (Editor)

fabrizio.masci@ingv.it

Received and published: 9 February 2015

Dear Authors, dear Prof. Derr,

Let me say that acting as Handling Editor of the manuscript nhess-2014-253 (Scoville et al., NHESSD, 2014) I took the liberty of suggesting the authors to include in the manuscript a discussion on the recent results published by Dahlgren et al. (2014), or more precisely, a discussion on how the presence of fluids in the Earth's crust can affect the results of their model. I did not think that this would generate a so lively debate and, more importantly, the reluctance of Scoville and coauthors to consider my suggestion (however, this is just my feeling). I note that the many arguments reported by Scoville and coauthors in their comments posted in this discussion phase can be included in their manuscript, that would make it, in my opinion, more interesting. I do not know the two recent BSSA submission of Prof. Freund (Freund 2015a, b). However, I think by

C3348

including in the manuscript of Scoville et al. a brief discussion on the role of fluids in the generation of pulses from stressed rocks will not lead to a duplicate publication.

I follow carefully the laboratory experiments of Prof. Freund as well as those of Dahlgren and his colleagues. I will read with great interest the two new BSSA papers of Prof. Freund.

The review process of the manuscript by Scoville and coauthors is still open and will continue without prejudices by the editor and reviewers.

Sincerely

Fabrizio Masci

References:

Dahlgren, P. R., M. J. S. Johnston, V. C. Vanderbilt, and R. N. Nakaba (2014), Comparison of the stress-stimulated current of dry and fluid saturated gabbro samples, Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America, 104, 2662-2672.

Freund, F., (2015a), Comment to: Comparison of the stress-stimulated current of dry and fluid saturated gabbro samples, Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America, submitted Dec. 28, 2014.

Freund, F. (2015b), Nature and sign of stress-activated electronic charge carriers in rock: Dry and wet gabbro, Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America, submitted Feb. 4, 2015.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 2, 7367, 2014.