



Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Towards a new BOLAM-MOLOCH suite for the SIMM forecasting system: implementation of an optimised configuration for the HyMeX Special Observation Periods” by S. Mariani et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 5 April 2014

1 Summary

In its current form, the document is not ready for publication. The document lacks clarity in presentation and provides insufficient analysis. However, the underlying system development and motivation to objectively assess are surely a firm foundation upon which one or more NHESS publications could be founded.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



2 More specific comments

Exactly what systems are being assessed? Each system chain presented should be clearly identified in both the text and in a schematic. The present document fails to do this. Figure 1 is inadequate and doesn't correspond well to the text; whilst also containing detail irrelevant to the discussion.

Readers in this field are accustomed to the omnipresence of system acronyms, but should reasonably expect to have results presented in a manner that mitigates 'acronym overload' and facilitates a focus on content.

Justification for the assessment methodology and conclusions.

Only precipitation and sea level for two IOP events are discussed. A motivation for this approach needs to be stated clearly from the outset. The few words offered in the conclusion section are insufficient - especially in contrast to the verbosity of the descriptive content in the body of the report.

The vague conclusions drawn apparently reflect the unexamined methodology. Do these results imply that deterministic 1-way forecast chains are fundamentally flawed? Contextualisation with regard to ensemble methods and coupling is absent.

Additional dot points:

- Why is 'optimised' used in the title?
- Little details of English use are generally not important, but the word 'coupled' on pp662 is ambiguous.
- Bajo(2012) is used in the text but isn't listed in the Reference section.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 2, 649, 2014.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

