



Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Modeling inundation of seasonally flooded wetlands at McCarran Ranch on Truckee River, USA” by X. Chen et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 15 November 2014

The manuscript describes an application of a 2-D Adaptive hydrodynamic model on a river reach of 10km length.

The paper is potentially interesting, however, in the present form, it suffers of some drawbacks that do not allow me to suggest its publication.

The main reason is the lack of innovative contribution indeed in the introduction there is no evidence of that. The AhD approach was previously applied in literature and it is important to underline the differences and the added values introduced in the submitted paper. Not only, since the topic is particularly important it is pivotal also to specify why the AhD approach should be preferred compared to the other tools available in literature.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



The second main drawback is related to the case study application and description. I am skeptical on the use of DEM at 30 meter of resolution for floodplain inundation analysis and it is not clear the AhD output since in the paper it was never shown an inundation map, but the attention is more related to the hydrograph shape.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 2, 3711, 2014.

NHESD

2, C2463–C2464, 2014

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper