



Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “A theoretical model for the initiation of debris flow in unconsolidated soil under hydrodynamic conditions” by C.-X. Guo et al.

P. Tarolli (Editor)

paolo.tarolli@unipd.it

Received and published: 26 September 2014

I read with interest this paper and the interactive discussion. The three referees provided a very useful discussion that definitely should help the authors to highlight the main critical issues of their work. A series of major critical issues have been raised. The paper needs to be revised in deep. The authors provided replies to three referees. Based on these I should give to the authors a chance to propose a revised version of the manuscript, but this would not guarantee a final publication.

Before my final decision I would like to have a public reply from the authors about this

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



critical issue:

their revised manuscript proposed in reply to the comments of reviewer #1 leaved me rather puzzled; the title was totally changed, the word “debris flow” was deleted for a new title “A theoretical model for shallow failure on unconsolidated soil slope considering overland and interstitial flow”. So now they introduced the word “shallow failure” thus providing a different manuscript or better, a different goal of the manuscript but with the same experiment. This is something strange at the eyes of the readers, and of course is not acceptable. Please provide a reply. The reviewer #1 and the others are also welcome in the discussion.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 2, 4487, 2014.

NHESSD

2, C2160–C2161, 2014

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



C2161