Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 2, C1995–C1996, 2014 www.nat-hazards-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/2/C1995/2014/

© Author(s) 2014. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



NHESSD

2, C1995-C1996, 2014

Interactive Comment

Interactive comment on "Epic landslide erosion from mountain roads in Yunnan, China – challenges for sustainable development" by R. C. Sidle et al.

Anonymous Referee #4

Received and published: 7 September 2014

This study appears to be a follow up of Sidle et al. (2011). This study covers the erosion rates along unpaved mountain roads, whereas Sidle et al. (2011) dealt with a paved road. Both studies call for attention to the ecological and environmental problems caused by road construction projects in Yunnan, China.

This reviewer has the following comments. First, although Sidle et al. (2011) is cited several times in the manuscript, no comparison is made between the two studies in the Results and Discussion section except for a reference on Page 11. Second, it is understood that the focus of the manuscript is on "landslide erosion from mountain roads," but it is also acknowledged by the authors that large storm events are an important

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



landslide trigger in the study area (lines 25-26 on Page 8) and they must be considered in landslide hazard assessments (lines 7-9 on Page 11). What is the role of storm events? Sidle et al. (2011) stated that surface erosion from all source was about 7% of the erosion from the road project. Is that the same in this study? Third, does the Chinese government publish any statistics on erosion rates so that they can be used as a validation source?

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 2, 3887, 2014.

NHESSD

2, C1995-C1996, 2014

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

