

Interactive comment on “A catalog of high-impact windstorms in Switzerland since 1859” by P. Stucki et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 28 July 2014

This is an excellent paper; it is thorough in its use both of sources and methods and contains much of value. This value is witnessed not only in terms of the index and catalogue, if you like, the climatology but also of the methods, which can surely be applied with equal success elsewhere. Of particular importance is the exhaustive nature of the data that have been gathered from a notably wide field of sources, both qualitative and quantitative. The management of such diverse material is always challenging but here accomplished with élan.

The paper is well-written and from the outset it is clear what the objectives are; this is not always the case in scientific enterprises and is a feature not to be under-valued. The authors make good use of published material in reviewing the overall setting of the paper. Most importantly they fully acknowledge, and discuss, the limitations of their

C1717

data sources and methods. At the same time the authors keep clear, very sensibly, of attempting to form obvious links with the current concerns on the mechanisms and attribution of climate variability. In this sense this pragmatic paper is free to review without prejudice the data that have been used in its preparation.

This reviewer compliments the authors on an excellent contribution to the field of ‘historical climatology’ and recommends it for publication with no need for revision.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 2, 3821, 2014.