



Interactive comment on “A two-phase model for numerical simulation of debris flows” by S. He et al.

P. Tarolli (Editor)

paolo.tarolli@unipd.it

Received and published: 15 July 2014

First of all I would like to thank the three referees for providing a very useful discussion that definitely should help the authors to highlight the main critical issues of their work. All the three referees recommended a rejection according to the following points:

- lack of novelty/originality respect to the previous papers that published analysis on the same topic;
- poor assumptions of the model;
- the fact that model used here does not deviate from the model already introduced by Pitman and Le (2005) and by Pudasaini (2011), mentioned several times in the paper.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



According to reviewer #3 this fact undermines the originality of the paper;

- According to reviewer #3 the greatest limitation of the model is the fact that it is not able to simulate the processes of erosion and deposition;

- According to reviewer #3 the present model is not simpler than other models, but because of the several limitations it is not suitable for many applications;

The authors provided replies to three referees, however at my eyes these are not enough to make the paper ready for the publication in NHESS. I still have some doubts about the novelty and originality of the model presented. I think that the work needs to be rethought and improved in several sessions, in order to make it ready for a new submission and peer-review stage.

Interactive comment on Nat. Hazards Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 2, 2151, 2014.

NHESSD

2, C1572–C1573, 2014

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C1573

